The Effectiveness of Caricature Media in Learning Writing of Argumentation Paragraph

Andi Sukri Syamsuri
Art and Humaniora Faculty, Islamic State University of Makassar, Indonesia

Muh. Arief Muhsin
Language and Education Faculty, Univeritas Muhammadiyah Makassar, Indonesia

Nurmayani
Indonesian Megister Program, Univeritas Muhammadiyah Makassar, Indonesia

Abstract—The research aimed to describe the effectiveness of the use of caricature media in learning writing of an argumentation paragraph in the tenth class of SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto. The research design was an experimental research by using quasi-experimental research design. The research subjects were the tenth grade students of SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto in 2015/2016 academic years which consisted of 131 students. They were divided into four classes. The data were analyzed by descriptive and t-test inferential statistics. The results showed that there was a significant difference between the learning writing of an argumentation paragraph by using the environment media and the writing ability of argumentation paragraph by using the caricature media, which was effective to be used as a learning medium to write an argumentation paragraph at the tenth class of SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto. Therefore, it can be concluded that the caricature media were effectively used in learning writing of argumentation paragraph.

Index Terms—writing, paragraph, argumentation, and caricature media

I. INTRODUCTION

In the formal education, the writing skill has a very important role, particularly in the essay writing of argumentation, exposition, description, narrative, and persuasive. To achieve that, the students must be guided and given the ability and skills to write well. The writing skill in learning of Indonesian language is one of the important skills that should be mastered by every student, because in some studies always emphasize the writing essays that are officially able to use Indonesian language properly compared with other aspects of language skills. The writing is the most difficult skill mastered by the students. Hence, it is not surprisingly that there were not many people who have the ability to write well. Practicing in systematic, continuous, and disciplined is the strategy that is always advised by skilled practitioners to be able to write. Writing is a skill that requires a process (Tarigan, 2008: 8), it means that the writing skill will not come by itself. This proves that writing is a mysterious process. But it is an art that can be taught, particularly in language learning in schools.

The learning writing of argumentation paragraph has been taught starting at Elementary Schools to Senior High School level. In this case, the researcher will more focus on the senior high school level. Learning writing skill of an argumentation paragraph at secondary school is part of the learning of Indonesian language. The overall objective of learning writing of argumentation paragraph is that the students are able to develop imagination, ideas, and opinions. One way to attract attention and accelerate students’ understanding of language skills in the learning process is the use of media or visual aid. For example, in learning writing of argumentation paragraph, as a medium that can be used is the caricature media. In this learning process, the students will observe a caricature drawing. After that, the students are expected to foster their creativity in expressing ideas, thoughts, and opinions by written language as a tool in writing learning process, especially writing of argumentation paragraph.

Based on the interview and observation of the teachers of Indonesian language subject at SMAN 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto, it was known that the teachers and students were difficult in learning writing of argumentation. The difficulty faced by teachers is the use of media and techniques that are not appropriate. While, the problems faced by students in learning writing, are such as lack of students’ interest in writing, the difficulty to develop ideas, thoughts and the difficulty of word choice and spelling is one cause of the tendency of the students to work procedurally, as well as understand the writing materials of argumentation without reasoning.

The failure of the learning process was happening because teachers more emphasize on the individual learning (Muhsin. M. Arief, 2016). The content, which is presented by the teachers, is not fully accepted by the students. The learning process was begun with a lecture that is conducted by teachers and listened by the students, and then teachers gave assignments to the students to make an essay. This made teaching and learning process in the classroom tends to
run passive; hence, it causes the students to feel bored, be less creative in generating ideas, be slow in the writing process, students were difficult to describe an object, etc. Therefore, the way that was implemented by the teachers in the learning process of argumentative writing shows that results are not optimal. This was due to the learning implementation is less effective because it does not use the media that can give encouragement or learning motivation to students. In fact, the students’ ability in learning writing skill can be developed optimally, if the teachers can use the appropriate media in the learning process.

One media that can be applied to improve students’ argumentation writing skills is the use of caricature media. The caricature media is the media that uses images to stimulate the students’ imagination. Caricature is one form of the simple and effective visual communications in delivering the message. In caricature, there are elements of intelligence, humorous, critical thinking accuracy, expressive in response to the social life phenomenon, and it contains the fact that readers are stimulated and encouraged to create their own interpretation in response to what is disclosed in their creation. The use of caricature media in the learning writing process enables students to write the systematic argumentation paragraph based on the drawings and able to sharpen the students’ intellectual thinking and imagination.

This research is basically same with some previous researches. The similarities are in terms of (1) the learning aspect that is used is writing and the use of caricature media, (2) most of the materials are same, and (3) there are two researches which are the experimental research. The differences with the previous researches are (1) the use of different media, models and methods; (2) there are the different content materials; (3) there are action researches, while the researcher conducted an experimental research; and (4) the different school subject.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

A. Writing

Writing is a communication activity in the form of delivering a message to others (Suparno, 2008: 29, Crossley, S. A., & McNamara, D. S., 2011). Writing is devoted chart symbols depicting a language that is understood by a person, so that others can read the chart symbols if they understand the language and the sort description. Writing is used to report or inform and influence the goals and objectives that can only be achieved well by people, who can organize their thoughts and states them clearly; the clarity depends on the mind, organization, words use, and sentence structure (Morsey in Tarigan, 2008: 4, Uysal, H. H., 2008, and Graham, S., & Perin, D., 2007).

Dalman (2014: 3), Deatline-Buchman, A., & Jitendra, A. K. (2006) states that writing is an activity in the form of delivering written message (information) to others by using the written language as a tool or medium. Writing activity involves several elements, namely the writer as delivering messages, writing content, channel or media, and readers.

Based on the definitions above, it can be concluded that writing is a process carried out by someone to express ideas or thoughts in written form.

B. Paragraph

According to Rahardi (2009: 158), Godó, Á. M. (2008), and Helms-Park, R., & Stapleton, P. (2003), visually paragraph is marked by two things, namely the first line is written protrudes into as many as five beats from the left margin and always started with a new line. Paragraphs are part of essay writing, which form an integral thoughts or ideas.

Furthermore, Keraf (2004: 69) states that the paragraph is not a conventional division of a chapter that consists of sentences, but the deeper meaning of cohesive sentences. The paragraph is a unity of mind, a unity that is higher or wider than a sentence. It is the set of related sentences in a series to form an idea.

It can be concluded that the paragraph is a series of interconnected sentences which are arranged logically and systematically, therefore, it forms a unity of ideas.

C. Argumentation

Argumentation is a rhetorical form that seeks to influence the others attitudes and opinions in order to believe and act as intended by the writer or speaker (Keraf, 2004: 3). Argumentation is a discourse that proves the truth or untruth of a statement. In the argumentation text, the writer uses a variety of strategies or rhetorical devices to convince the readers about the truth or untruth of the statement (Alwasilah in Efendi, 2015, Fluit - Dupuy, J., 2001, and Nussbaum, E. M., 2008).

Based on the explanation above, it can be concluded that the argumentation is a type of paragraph which is used to express an opinion and tried to convince others towards the truth of that opinion.

D. Media

In Arabic, media means an intermediary or an introductory message from the sender to the receiver (Arsyad, 2011: 3, Moran, M., Seaman, J., & Tinti-Kane, H., 2011, and Cao, Y., Ajjan, H., & Hong, P., 2013). Learning media is anything that can be used to stimulate the students’ mind, feelings, concerns and willingness in order to encourage the learning process for students. The media should be manipulated, can be seen, heard and read (Sadiman, 2009: 113).

E. The Caricature Media
The caricature is derived from the word of caricare (Italian) which means that giving extra charge or additional. The caricature is a messaging media which is drawn in a simple and easy to understand. 

Rohani (1997: 79-80), Parry, B., & Powell, M. (2011), d Ju, B. A. I. (2011) states that the caricature is a form of image that is cliché, satire, criticism, and funny. The caricature is the expression of someone’s feelings which are expressed to be known to the public. Caricature as a communication media contains messages, criticisms or satires without many comments, but it simply contains fiction images that are funny and implies the caustic meaning. In the instructional communication, caricature can be used as an instructional media, which means that the caricature media will demand learners’ creativity, as well as to train critical thinking and have a sensitivity or social awareness, sharpens the students’ intellectual thinking and imagination.

III. RESEARCH METHOD

A. Type of the Research

Based on the research’s title, which was “The Effectiveness of the Caricature Media in Learning Writing of Argumentation Paragraph at the tenth class of SMAN 1 Bontoramba, this research was classified into the experimental research. The experimental research can be interpreted as the research method used to find a particular difference in treatment to the others in the uncontrolled conditions. (Sugiyono, 2012: 107).

B. Research Variables and Design

1. Research Variables

The variable is the research object or what is the focal point of a study (Arikunto, 2013: 161). This research used two observed variables, namely X variable and Y variable. The application of the caricature media and the environment media in this research was categorized ad independent variable, or the instructional media of caricature as X1 variable and the environment media as X2 variable. Meanwhile, the students’ writing skill of the argumentation paragraph at the tenth class of SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba was as independent variable or as Y variable. Y1 was an experimental class, the pretest of experimental class was Y1.1, the posttest of experimental class was Y1.2, the pretest of control class was Y2.1, and the posttest of control class was Y2.2.

2. Research Design

This research used a quantitative approach; the research design was a quasi-experiment design. Both of these classes were each given a pretest to determine the initial state that was there any difference between the experimental and control class.

Referring to the description above, the research design was conducted with the following pattern.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class</th>
<th>Pretest</th>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Posttest</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Y1.1</td>
<td>X1</td>
<td>Y1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Y2.1</td>
<td>X2</td>
<td>Y2.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Furchan (2007: 395)

Notation:
A= Experimental class
B= Control class
Y1.1= Pretest of Experimental class
Y2.1= Pretest of Control class
X1= Treatment by using caricature media
X2= Treatment by using environment media
Y1.2= Posttest of Experimental class
Y2.2= Posttest of Control class

C. Operational Definition of Variables

As explained previously that the research variables consisted of two variables, namely the caricature and environment media and the writing ability of argumentation paragraph. Hence, these variables are defined as follows:

1. The caricature media is the teaching instructional media in the form of images-laden humor with the human objects or objects that contain a specific meaning for readers.

2. The environment learning media is an understanding of a particular symptom of behavior of the object or scientific observation of the things that are around us as the teaching material for students before and after receiving materials from the school by bringing experiences and discoveries with what they encounter in their environment.

3. The argumentation is a form of the opinion that seeks to influence the others’ attitudes and opinions in order to believe and act as intended by the writer or speaker.

4. The writing of argumentation paragraph is a type of paragraph used to express an opinion and tried to convince others towards the truth of the opinion.

D. Population and Sample
Population is a set and the whole objects to be investigated. The population of this research was the whole tenth grade classes of SMAN 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto totaling of 133 students, which were divided into four classes.

The sample is representative selected from the population and serves as the research subject. The sample in this research was taken by using purposive sampling technique or intended sample, namely the technique to determine the sample with the certain considerations in accordance with the desired purposes. The researcher considered these second classes that would be taken as the research subject by looking at the characteristic of homogeneous students. The research sample was assigned that X2 class consisting of 32 students as the control class and X1 class consisting of 32 students as the experimental class.

E. Research Instrument

The instrument was used as a data collection procedure. In this research, the instrument used was the description test. The test form referred to this research instrument was the writing task of argumentation paragraph through the use of caricature media for the experimental class and the environment media provided to students in control class. This test was used to collect data in the form of the writing skill score of argumentation paragraph which was obtained by the students, both of pretest and posttest scores. The instrument used was firstly tested for its validity. The validity test was intended to determine that a suitable instrument test used to test the students’ writing ability in the argumentation essay writing. The validity test used the experts’ validity test in the education field. The experts, who were validated the instruments, were Prof. Dr. Achmad Tolla, M.Pd. and Dr. H. Akmal Hamsa, M.Pd.

F. Data Collection Technique

The data collection technique used in this research was assigned tasks to the two classes, i.e., experimental and control class. The tasks given to the students were making argumentation paragraph. These tasks were used to obtain the data of the students’ achievement both of experimental and control class. In this procedure, the students were assigned to write the argumentation paragraph with the basic competence of Educational unit level curriculum (SBC) for the tenth class in the second semester.

G. Data Analysis Technique

The data analysis technique used in this research was descriptive and inferential statistical analysis, consisting of:

1) The descriptive statistical analysis

The descriptive analysis seeks to analyze the data through a general description of the findings obtained. The steps were conducted with the descriptive analysis, such as:

a. Making the list of raw score
b. Making the frequency distribution

The data obtained from the correction process, generally was still in uncertainty results. For facilitate the analysis, it is needed to arrange the frequency distribution which can be easy for further calculation.

c. Making the histogram of the frequency distribution

The usefulness of the histogram was to determine the data distribution/dissemination; therefore, it was obtained more information from the data and it would make easier to obtain conclusions from these data.

2) The inferential statistical analysis

The inferential statistical analysis was used to test the research hypothesis by using t-test. However, the normality test was firstly conducted before testing the hypothesis. To determine whether the sample taken from the research population had the same variant and did not show a significant difference between one another. To test the sample’s homogeneity, it was needed to conduct t-test of pretest for the writing ability of argumentation paragraph both of experimental and control class. Furthermore, to determine the effectiveness of the caricature media, the hypothesis testing was conducted by using t-test and calculation of gain score. This test was analyzed by using the computer program of SPSS version 21.

IV. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

A. The Results of Data Analysis

This subsection presents the detail data of the research results on the effectiveness of caricature media for argumentation paragraph writing at the tenth class of SMA Negero 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto. The data were collected based on the research data collection procedure that was the use of media caricature for experimental class and the use of environment media for control class.

The data used in this research were the data of the writing skills score of argumentation paragraph both of pretest and posttest score in the control and experimental class. The data of pretest and posttest were obtained from the argumentation writing test.

1. The Comparative Statistics of Pretest and Posttest of Argumentation Paragraph Writing Ability in Experimental and Control Class

The comparison of the highest score, lowest score, the mean and median on the pretest and posttest is presented in the following table.
Table 4.1 shows a comparison of the highest score, the lowest score, mean and median between the control class and experimental class both of pretest and posttest. Based on the results in Table 4.1, it can be concluded that there is an improvement in the experimental and control class in the learning writing of argumentation paragraph. The improvement of the experimental class is more significant after giving the treatments by using the caricature media.

B. The Test Requirements Analysis

The normality test in this research was conducted on the students’ scores of writing ability of argumentation paragraph in pretest and posttest both of experimental and control class. The following Table 4.2 figures out the distribution data of normality test which were calculated by using SPSS version 21.

The results of SPSS 21 analysis showed that the data distribution in this research was normal. The results of the normality test of the data distribution in pretest and posttest for the argumentation paragraph writing ability both of experimental and control class revealed the normal distribution. Therefore, the data had been qualified to be analyzed.

C. The Results of Hypothesis Testing Analysis

1. The Result of First Hypothesis Testing

The first hypothesis in this research is “there is no difference between the classes which are given the treatments by using caricature media and the treatments by using non caricature media in learning writing of argumentation paragraph at the tenth class of SMANegeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto.” The hypothesis was the null hypothesis (H0).

In calculating or testing, H0 should be changed to Ha (alternative hypothesis) that became “there is difference between classes which were treated by using the caricature media and by using non caricature media in learning writing of argumentation paragraph at the tenth class of SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto.”

2. The Results of Second Hypothesis Testing

The second hypothesis in this research is the caricature media is effective to be used in the learning writing ability of argumentation paragraph at the tenth class of SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto. The result of the second hypothesis testing obtained from the t-test calculation was analyzed by using a computer program of SPSS version 21. The requirement of the significant data is revealed by the consideration if p value is less than 0.05. The use of Gain score was also conducted to prove the data analysis in order to determine the effectiveness of the use of caricature media in the learning writing of argumentation paragraph that the tenth class of SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto. The use of caricature media for the experimental class was revealed that to be effective when the normalized gain average of the experimental class was higher than the normalized gain average of the control class.

3. The Hypothesis Testing

The hypothesis testing was conducted after the analysis data by using t-test. Hence, it was revealed that the hypothesis testing results were presented as follows.

a. The first hypothesis

H0: null hypothesis. There is no difference of the learning writing of argumentation paragraph between the class which is treated by using the caricature media and the class which is not treated by using the caricature media at the tenth class of SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto. It was rejected.

H1: alternative hypothesis. There is difference of the learning writing of argumentation paragraph between the class which is treated by using the caricature media and the class which is not treated by using the caricature media at the tenth class of SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto. It was accepted.

b. The second hypothesis

H0: null hypothesis. The caricature media is not effective to be used as an instructional media in the learning writing of argumentation paragraph at the tenth class of SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto. It was rejected.

H1: alternative hypothesis. The caricature media is effective to be used as an instructional media in the learning writing of argumentation paragraph at the tenth class of SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto. It was accepted.
D. The Discussion of the Research Results

This research was conducted in SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto. The population in this research was the tenth class, with a sample of 64 students. The sample was taken by using purposive sampling of intended sample, which is the technique of determining the sample with the certain considerations in accordance with the desired purposes. Based on this technique, it was obtained that the X2 class as the control group which was not treated by using the caricature media and the class X1 as the control group which was treated by using the caricature media in the learning writing of argumentation paragraph. This research aimed to determine the effectiveness of the caricature media when it was used for learning writing of argumentation paragraph at the tenth class of SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto.

The learning writing of argumentation paragraph by using the caricature media can help students to discover and develop their ideas and opinions. Besides, students will better understand about the argumentation paragraph by using the caricature media.

V. Conclusion

A. Conclusions

Based on the research results and discussion that had been presented in the previous section, it can be concluded that first, there were differences in writing ability of the argumentation paragraph writing between class which was given treatments by using the caricature media and the class which was not given treatments by using the caricature media at the tenth class of SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto. The differences of writing ability of the argumentation paragraph could be proved by the final t-test results of the experimental and control class. T-test was calculated by using SPSS 21 program. The calculation result showed that the t-value was 4.968, with degree of freedom was 62 and p value was 0.000. It was revealed that the p-value was less than 0.05 (p<0.05). The t-test analysis result showed that there were significant differences between the experimental class which was given the learning writing of argumentation paragraph by using the caricature media and the control class which was given the learning without the use of the caricature media.

The second, the results showed that the use of the caricature media was effective to be used as an instructional media in learning of the argumentation paragraph writing at the tenth class of SMA Negeri 1 Bontoramba Jeneponto. The difference in the effectiveness of the argumentation paragraph writing was described by t-test results on the pretest and posttest for control class obtained the t-value of 5.697 with the degree of freedom of 31 and obtained p-value of 0.000. The p value was less than the significance level of 5% (0.000 < 0.05) which stated that the learning in control class was effective. The pretest and posttest of experimental class were obtained t-value was 5.159 with degree of freedom of 31 and p value was 0.000. The p value was less than the significance level of 5% (0.000 < 0.05) which revealed that the learning in experimental class was effective. The use of caricature media is effective if the mean normalized gain score of experimental class is higher than the mean normalized gain score of control class. The result of gain score calculation showed that the value of gain score in the experimental class was 6.50, while in the control group was 2.21. Therefore, it can be concluded that the caricature media was effective to be used in the learning writing of the argumentation paragraph.

B. Suggestions

Based on the research results and discussion, it can be put forward several suggestions. These suggestions are addressed to several parties, such as:

1. For teachers, they should be more creative in selecting instructional media, for example, using the caricature media. Hence, the learning process becomes more attractive and does not make learners feel bored. Technically, the results of this research can be used as reference by teachers of Indonesian language subject in teaching argumentation essay writing. The use of appropriate media will help to achieve the objectives and the target of learning achievements.

2. For schools, they should recommend to the teachers of Indonesian language subject to use more variety of media in learning process and fully support the teachers to create fun learning situation.

3. For students, they should be more active in the learning process in the school and always be serious to follow the learning process although it is in a relaxed situation. Besides, students also have to practice more to improve their writing ability, because writing skill requires sustainable training.

REFERENCES

Andi Sukri Syamsuri was born in Kabupaten Wajo on June 26th, 1971. He saturated his education in elementary school in SDN 29 Bonhouse, Kabupaten Wajo and his high education at SMPN Tanasisto Kabupaten Wajo and SPGN Sengkang Kabupaten Wajo. After graduated from high school, he started his education in university at young bachelor degree of Language education and Buginese Art department, faculty of Language, Art, and education. He continued his bachelor degree at Indonesian language and education, universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar. His master of degree was at Indonesian Language Post graduate program in Hasanuddin University. His doctoral program was at Indonesian Linguistic, Post graduate program in Hasanuddin University of Indonesia.

His job now as a lecturer at Islamic State University of Makassar in Art and Humaniora Faculty. Beside that he is Outstanding Lecturer in several public and private colleges (Examiner / Supervisor S3).

His complete name and titles is “Dr. Andi Sukri Syamsuri, M. Hum.” In addition, he has a lot of organisation and appreciations likes:1. Exemplary Student of the Republic of Indonesia in 1993, 2. The former chairman of Central Association of Students Wajo 1995-1998, 3. The Chairman of the Alumni Association of State SPG Wajo Sengkang Year 2011-2016, 4. The Chairman of the Association of Private Education Institutions Education Workforce Region IX Sulawesi Indonesia Year 2010-2014, 5. The Deputy Secretary of the Association of Indonesian Pembina Branch South Sulawesi, 6. The Chief Executive of Teacher Certification Rayon 146 South Sulawesi Ministry of Education and in 2008 -2012, 2013 – 2017, 7. Award Certificate of Educator as Professional Lecturer at Indonesian Linguistic Post graduate program in Hasanuddin University. His doctoral program was at Indonesian Linguistic, Post graduate program in Hasanuddin University of Indonesia.
Muh. Arief Muhsin was born on July 02nd, 1983 in Kabupaten Sinjai, South Sulawesi, Indonesia. His elementary school was at SDN 88 Jennnae, Kabupaten Sinjai and graduated in 1995. He moved from Sinjai Kabupaten Gowa to continue his junior high school in SMP Negeri 3 Sungguminasa and graduated in 1998. His senior high school was at SMA negeri 11 Makassar and he graduated in 2001. To develop his knowledge, he continued his study in university. His bachelor degree was at Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar, English education program, he graduated in 2008. His master of degree was State University of Makassar with same program, in English edutaion Departement. Now is a lecturer at English education department in Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar. There were many funding of research he got from Indonesia government like Young lecturer funding in 2014, competitiveness funding in 2015 until now, volunteer program funding and some Corporate Social Rwsponding (CSR) from some government corporation.

His complete name right now is “MUH. ARIEF MUHSIN, S. Pd., M. Pd”. He also joined some professional groups like Indonesian Lecturer Forum (2015-now), Young professional researchers organization, and some private legal organization in Indonesia.

Nurmayani, born on December 31, 1990 in Soppeng. The author was the second of three brothers. Born from the fruit of love nurdin, S.Pd. M, Si., And burrows, S.Pd. author started formal education in kindergarten Aisha lajoa in 1994 and graduated in 1996. Then continued his education at the State Elementary School 85 Cacaleppeng in 1996 and graduated in 2001. After that, the author then continued his education in SMP Negeri 1 Liliriaja in 2002 and graduated in 2005. Entering middle bunch, the writer continued his education at SMAN 1 Liliriaja in 2005 and graduated in 2008. In 2008-2013, the author completed undergraduate level courses Indonesian Language and Literature Education at the State University of Makassar on in 2013, then went Indonesian Masters of Education at the same university in 2014.